



Variation of Ba concentrations in some plants grown in Pakistan depending on traffic density

Mehmet Cetin^{1,2} · Asma Asghar Jawed³

Received: 27 December 2021 / Revised: 8 January 2022 / Accepted: 11 January 2022 / Published online: 15 January 2022
© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2022

Abstract

Today, one of the most important problems in the world is environmental and especially air pollution. Among the components of air pollution, especially heavy metals are of particular importance because they do not deteriorate and disappear easily in nature, can be toxic and carcinogenic to humans even at low concentrations, and bioaccumulate in living organisms. Therefore, it is extremely important to determine the heavy metal concentrations in the air. Barium (Ba), which has been largely neglected in studies on heavy metals, plays a key role in the production of many products in the industry. However, Ba is one of the most dangerous heavy metals and all barium compounds are toxic. This study was aimed to determine the accumulation of Ba concentration in some plants used extensively in Pakistan depending on traffic density. For this purpose, the variation of Ba concentrations in leaves and branches of *Ficus bengalensis*, *Ziziphus mauritiana*, *Conocarpus erectus*, and *Azadrechtia indica* species depending on traffic density was determined. As a result of the study, it was determined that the most suitable species to be used for monitoring Ba concentration were *Azadrechtia indica* leaves, and the most suitable organs were *Azadrechtia indica* leaves.

Keywords Heavy metal · Pakistan · Barium · Ba · Traffic

1 Introduction

The world population has increased significantly in the last century, exceeding 7.9 billion [1], and it has concentrated in urban areas due to the developments in the industrial field [2–10]. Developments in the field of the industry have led to a significant increase in air pollution, especially in some regions, and air pollution has become one of the biggest problems in the world today. It is reported that 92% of the world's population lives in areas with low air quality and approximately 1 in 8 deaths are caused by air pollution [11–29].

Among the components of air pollution, heavy metals are of particular importance in terms of human and environmental health, because heavy metals tend to bioaccumulate in living bodies. Some of them can be toxic, carcinogenic, and deadly even at low concentrations. Although some are essential nutrients for living organisms, they are harmful at high levels. In addition, heavy metals do not easily deteriorate and disappear in nature [14–32]. In addition, heavy metals in the air can be much more dangerous by entering the human body directly through the respiratory tract [24–40].

Due to the effects of heavy metals on humans and the environment, many studies have been carried out to monitor the concentrations of heavy metals, especially in the air. However, the studies mostly focused on heavy metals such as Pb, Ni, Cd, Cr, and Co [41, 42]. Barium (Ba) is an element that plays a key role in the production of many products in the industry. In the production of Zn, Pb, and Ag, rubber, ink, brake pads, paint, rat poison, medicine, radio vacuum tube and lamps, machine oil, optical glass, photographic paper, detergents, wax, plastic and textile products, drilling applications, glue Barium, its isotopes, compounds, and alloys are used in paper coatings, batteries, the production of special glasses, the production of oil paints, the petroleum industry, fireworks, and ceramic glazes.

✉ Asma Asghar Jawed
aasmaasgharjawedkastamonu@gmail.com

¹ Faculty of Engineering and Architecture, Department of Landscape Architecture, Kastamonu University, Kastamonu, Turkey

² Present Address: Faculty of Architecture, Department of City and Regional Planning, Ondokuz Mayıs University, Samsun, Turkey

³ Department of Materials Sciences and Engineering, Institute of Science, Kastamonu University, Kastamonu, Turkey

However, Ba is one of the most dangerous heavy metals and all barium compounds are toxic [43]. Therefore, it is of great importance to monitor the change in Ba concentration in the air. However, Ba has generally been neglected in studies conducted so far, and a very limited number of studies have been carried out to monitor the change in Ba concentration in the air. In this study, the usability of some plants used extensively in Pakistan in monitoring the change of various Ba concentrations was evaluated.

2 Material and method

This study was aimed to determine the accumulation of Ba concentration in some plants used extensively in Pakistan depending on traffic density. For this purpose, leaf samples from four species were collected. *Ficus bengalensis* (Fb), *Ziziphus mauritiana* (Zm), *Conocarpus erectus* (Ce), and *Azadirachta indica* (Ai) were used in the study.

The study was conducted on individuals in heavy traffic (TRCOK), moderately heavy traffic (TRAZ), and almost no traffic (TRYOK) areas. To determine the effect of particulate matter on the branch and leaf samples taken from the individuals subject to the study, the washing process was carried out and the study was carried out on the washed organs (Yk) and non-washed organs (Ykm). Thus, measurements were made with 3 replications on 48 samples of 4 species, 3 traffic densities, 2 organs, and 2 items of washing.

The dried plant samples were ground into powder and weighed 0.5 g and placed in tubes designed for microwave. Ten milliliters of 65% HNO₃ was added to the samples. The prepared samples were then burned in a microwave device at 280 PSI and 180 °C for 20 min. After the processes were completed, the tubes were removed from the microwave and left to cool. Deionized water was added to the cooled samples to make up to 50 ml. After the prepared samples were filtered through filter paper, they were read in the ICP-OES device at appropriate wavelengths. Ba concentrations were calculated by multiplying the obtained values with the dilution factor.

The obtained data were evaluated with the help of the SPSS package program, variance analysis was applied to the data, and homogeneous groups were obtained by applying the Duncan test to the groups that were statistically different at least 95% confidence level. The data obtained were simplified and interpreted by tabulating.

3 Results

The F value, error rate, mean values, and Duncan test results obtained as a result of the variance analysis regarding the variation of Ba concentrations depending on the type and traffic density are given in Table 1.

When the variation of Ba concentrations based on type and traffic density is examined, it is seen that the changes based on species in all traffic densities are statistically significant ($p < 0.001$). As a result of the Duncan test at all traffic densities, the values obtained in Zm and Ce types were in the first groups, and the values obtained in Ai were in the last groups.

It was determined that the variation of Ba concentrations on a species basis depending on traffic density was statistically significant ($p < 0.05$) only in Zm and Ai species. In both species, Ba concentration increases with traffic density. The F value, error rate, mean values, and Duncan test results obtained as a result of the variance analysis regarding the variation of Ba concentrations depending on the species, organ, washing status, and traffic density are given in Table 2.

When the table values are examined, it is seen that the change of Ba concentration based on organs in all traffic densities and based on traffic density in all organs is statistically significant at the 99.9% confidence level ($p < 0.001$). In TRYOK areas, the lowest values were obtained in Fb leaves washed with Zm branches; the highest values were obtained in unwashed Fb leaves and branches and unwashed Ai leaves. In TRAZ areas, the lowest values were obtained in washed Fb, Zm, and Ce branches; the highest values were obtained in unwashed Fb leaves and Ai leaves. In TRCOK areas, the lowest values were obtained in Ce leaves and washed Ce leaves, while the highest values were obtained in unwashed Fb leaves and Ai leaves. It is noteworthy that, in general, the values obtained in unwashed Fb and Ai leaves are among the highest in all three traffic densities. In addition, it is seen that the lowest values are obtained in TRYOK areas and the highest values in TRCOK areas in most of the organs.

4 Discussions

As a result of the study, it was determined that the changes in Ba concentrations based on species in all traffic densities were statistically significant ($p < 0.001$). As a result of the Duncan test at all traffic densities, the values obtained in Zm and Ce types were in the first groups, and the values

Table 1 Variation of Ba (ppb) concentrations by species and traffic density

TUR	TRYOK	TRAZ	TRCOK	F
Fb	2699.2 b	2341.0 b	3314.3 b	0.5 ns
Zm	445.7 Aa	1151.4 Aa	2779.8 Bab	20.8***
Ce	767.0 a	1240.0 a	1162.4 a	2.7 ns
Ai	2066.6 Ab	3341.7 ABc	3982.1 Bb	4.6*
F	12.0***	9.4***	4.4***	

Table 2 Variation of Ba (ppb) concentrations

Species	Organ	Washed	TRYOK	TRAZ	TRCOK	F value
Fb	Leaf	Yk	461.3 Ac	1547.1 Cf	984.2 Bb	1918.7***
		Ykm	5497.8 Bm	5148.6 Ak	7831.5 Cl	3142.6***
	Branch	Yk	2070.8 Cj	786.5 Ac	1071.5 Bc	17,344.9***
		Ykm	2766.8 Bk	1881.9 Ag	3370.1 Cg	9440.3***
Zm	Leaf	Yk	512.3 Ad	1329.2 Be	4143.8 Ch	125,820.9***
		Ykm	714.3 Ae	1865.7 Bg	4235.6 Ci	24,840.0***
	Branch	Yk	210.7 Aa	604.8 Bb	1387.3 Cd	31,808.9***
		Ykm	345.4 Ab	806.0 Bc	1352.4 Cd	40,739.3***
Ce	Leaf	Yk	519.1 Ad	1565.5 Cf	954.3 Bb	13,230.8***
		Ykm	1039.4 Ah	1911.3 Bh	2227.8 Cf	11,897.8***
	Branch	Yk	1005.8 Cg	508.6 Ba	497.6 Aa	23,611.2***
		Ykm	503.6 Ad	974.8 Bd	969.8 Bb	13,942.1***
Ai	Leaf	Yk	2065.4 Aj	3600.2 Bj	5842.3 Cj	177,552.4***
		Ykm	3353.6 Al	5331.1 Bl	6248.6 Ck	9413.8***
	Branch	Yk	922.2 Af	2529.6 Ci	2213.9 Bf	14,752.6***
		Ykm	1925.4 Bi	1905.8 Bh	1623.6 Ae	637.5***
F value			34,727.5***	42,648.9***	29,138.1***	

*** $p < 0.001$. Yk, washed; Ykm, unwashed

obtained in Ai were in the last groups. It has been stated in many studies that the accumulation level of heavy metals in different species is at different levels [44–46], and the most important factor affecting heavy metal accumulation in plant species has been emphasized [42].

This situation is largely shaped by the anatomical structure of the plant and the mutual interaction of the plant and the heavy metal. Plant metabolism, like all phenotypic characters, depends on plant genetic structure [47–49], and environmental conditions [50–53] are shaped under their mutual interaction. Therefore, the stress level, which significantly affects plant metabolism [54–59], the genetic structure of the plant [60–62], hormone applications [63–65], cultural processes such as pruning and shading [66–68] and many factors affect the accumulation of elements in plants [69, 70]. In addition, the changing environment and soil structure due to human influence in urban areas and micro-ecological factors caused by human influence [71–73] affect the change of element concentration in plant organs.

Within the scope of the study, it was determined that there was a significant difference in Ba concentrations between plant organs. It is stated that besides the plant species, heavy metal concentrations in different organs of the same plant can vary significantly [74]. Heavy metal concentrations in different organs of plants grown in the same environment vary depending on factors such as the structure, morphology, surface area, surface texture, and size of the plant organ [75]. For example, plant leaves can absorb heavy metals in the air through stomata during air entry and exit, and in this case, the stomatal structure affects the uptake of heavy metals into the leaf structure.

Similarly, the rough and cracked shell surface can facilitate the adhesion of heavy metals there [76, 77]. Therefore, the structure and characteristics of the organ can significantly affect heavy metal intake.

The results of the study generally show that Ba concentration increases with traffic density. Heavy metals can be emitted into the atmosphere from different sources. However, it is stated that the most important heavy metal sources are mines, industrial facilities, and traffic sources [78–81]. Therefore, it has been stated in various studies that heavy metal concentrations are higher in plants grown in regions close to heavy metal sources [82].

The entry of heavy metals into the plant body can be mainly through roots and leaves [40, 83]. However, it is not easy to determine the source of the elements determined in the plant, because these uptake pathways can work simultaneously [42]. Therefore, factors affecting soil and air composition also affect element concentrations in plants [84]. For example, air pollution in urban areas increases the concentration of heavy metals, many of which act as micronutrients, in the air [40, 58, 85]. Air pollution and anthropogenic factors in urban areas can also cause soil pollution [86, 87]. Therefore, since the soil is one of the important factors in the growth of plants [88–90], the concentrations of these elements are higher in plants grown in these areas [83, 91, 92]. As a result, the change of element concentration in plant organs is the result of a complex mechanism dependent on the interaction of many factors, and this mechanism has not been fully resolved yet [14, 32, 33, 91].

5 Conclusions

Heavy metals are elements that can be extremely dangerous and harmful to human and environmental health, and one of them, Ba, is an element that has a wide range of uses and is extremely poisonous. Therefore, it is extremely important to monitor the change in its concentration in the air during the process. However, very few studies have been carried out to monitor the change in Ba concentration. Therefore, it is recommended that studies on elements such as Ba, which are very harmful to human and environmental health, should be continued by diversifying and increasing.

Species that can be used in monitoring the change of heavy metals should be determined separately for each heavy metal. Among the species subject to this study, it was determined that the most suitable species to be used for monitoring Ba concentration was Ai, and the most suitable organ was Ai leaves. It is recommended to use this species and organ for monitoring Ba concentration.

Acknowledgements This study was produced from the PhD study supported within the scope of Kastamonu University Scientific Research Projects project number KÜ-BAP03/2021-04. This study was produced from a Doctoral study at Kastamonu University, Institute of Science Graduate Studies Research Projects (Ph.D.). It was supported within the scope of Kastamonu University, Scientific Research Project Graduate Studies Research Projects (Ph.D.). Thanks to the advisor and Kastamonu University Institute of Science Department of Material Science and Engineering for Ph.D. thesis. Also thanks to Kastamonu University Scientific Research project—Graduate Studies Research Projects (Ph.D.). The project number is KÜ-BAP03/2021-04; the title of project “Change of stoma characters due to air pollution”

Author contribution MC and AAJ designed the study and performed the experiments; AAJ and MC performed the experiments, analyzed the data, and wrote the manuscript.

Funding This study was produced from the PhD study supported within the scope of Kastamonu University Scientific Research Projects project number KÜ-BAP03/2021-04.

Availability of data and materials The datasets used and/or analyzed during the current study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

Code availability Not applicable.

Declarations

Ethics approval and consent to participate Not applicable.

Consent for publication Not applicable.

Competing interests The authors declare no competing interests.

References

1. Worldometers (2021) access on 06/10/2021. <https://www.worldometers.info/>
2. Nowak DJ, Walton JT, Dwyer JF, Kaya LG, Myeong S (2005) The increasing influence of urban environments on US forest management. *J Forest* 103(8):377–382. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jof/103.8.377>
3. Isinkaralar K (2020). Removal of formaldehyde and BTEX in indoor air using activated carbon produced from horse chestnut (*Aesculus Hippocastanum* L.) Shell. Ph.D. Thesis Hacettepe University, Institute of Science and Engineering, Department of Environmental Engineering. Ankara, Turkey.
4. Kilicoglu C, Cetin M, Aricak B (2020) Sevik H (2020) Site selection by using the multi-criteria technique—a case study of Bafra, Turkey. *Environ Monit Assess* 192(9):608. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-020-08562-1>
5. Bayraktar OY (2020) The use of rice husk waste in foam concrete production. *Turkish J Agric-Food Sci Technol* 8(12):2716–2722
6. Sahin G, Cabuk SN (2021) Cetin M (2021) The change detection in coastal settlements using image processing techniques: a case study of Korfez. *Environ Sci Pollut Res*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-16660-x>
7. Cetin M, Aksoy T, Cabuk SN, Kurkcuoglu MAS, Cabuk A (2021) Employing remote sensing technique to monitor the influence of newly established universities in creating an urban development process on the respective cities. *Land Use Policy* 109:105705. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2021.105705>
8. Cetin M, Agacsapan B, Cabuk SN, Senyel Kurkcuoglu MA, Isik Pekkan O, Baran Argun E, ... Cabuk A (2021) Assessment of the ecological footprint of Eskisehir Technical University—İki Eylül Campus. *J Indian Soc Remote Sens* 2021;49(10):2311–2327. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12524-021-01395-6>
9. Pekkan OI, Kurkcuoglu MAS, Cabuk SN, Aksoy T, Yilmazel B, Kucukpehlivan T, ... Cetin M (2021) Assessing the effects of wind farms on soil organic carbon. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 2021;28(14):18216–18233. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-11777-x>
10. Gungor S, Cetin M (2021) Adiguzel F (2021) Calculation of comfortable thermal conditions for Mersin urban city planning in Turkey. *Air Qual Atmos Health* 14(4):515–522. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-020-00955-y>
11. Cetin M (2020) The changing of important factors in the landscape planning occur due to global climate change in temperature, Rain and climate types: a case study of Mersin City. *Turk J Agric-Food Sci Technol* 8(12):2695–2701
12. Cetin M (2020) Climate comfort depending on different altitudes and land use in the urban areas in Kahramanmaraş City. *Air Qual Atmos Health* 13(8):991–999. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-020-00858-y>
13. Adiguzel F, Cetin M, Kaya E, Simsek M, Gungor S (2020) Bozdogan Sert E (2020) Defining suitable areas for bioclimatic comfort for landscape planning and landscape management in Hatay. *Turkey Theor Appl Climatol* 139(3):1493–1503. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00704-019-03065-7>
14. Cetin M (2019) The effect of urban planning on urban formations determining bioclimatic comfort area's effect using satellitia images on air quality: a case study of Bursa city. *Air Qual Atmos Health* 12:1237–1249. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-019-00742-4>
15. Kaya LG, Cetin M, Doygun H (2009) A holistic approach in analyzing the landscape potential: Porsuk Dam Lake and its environs, Turkey. *Fresen Environ Bull* 18(8):1525–1533
16. Elsunousi AAM, Sevik H, Cetin M, Ozel HB (2021) Ucu Ozal H (2021) Periodical and regional change of particulate matter and

- CO₂ concentration in Misurata. *Environ Monit Assess* 193:707. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-021-09478-0>
17. Yücedağ C, Kaya LG (2016) Hava kirleticilerin bitkilere etkileri. Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniv Fen Bilimleri Enstit Derg 7(1):67–74
 18. Yücedağ C, Çiçek N, Gailing O (2021) Local adaptation at a small geographic scale observed in *Juniperus excelsa* populations in southern Turkey. *iForest-Biogeosci Forest* 14(6):531. <https://doi.org/10.3832/for3769-014>
 19. Kaya LG (2009) Assessing forests and lands with carbon storage and sequestration amount by trees in the State of Delaware, USA. *Sci Res Essays* 4(10):1100–1108
 20. Kaya LG, Kaynakci-Elinc Z, Yucedag C, Cetin M (2018) Environmental outdoor plant preferences: a practical approach for choosing outdoor plants in urban or suburban residential areas in Antalya, Turkey. *Fresen Environ Bull* 27(12):7945–7952
 21. Kaya LG, Yücedağ C, Duruşkan Ö (2015) Burdur Gölü havzasının çevresel açıdan irdelenmesi. Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniv Fen Bilimleri Enstit Derg 6(1):6–10
 22. Cetin M, Sevik H, Turkyilmaz A, Isinkaralar K (2021) Using *Abies*'s needles as biomonitors of recent heavy metal accumulation. *Kastamonu Univ Jof Eng Sci* 7(1):1–6
 23. Uzun Ozel H, Ozel HB, Cetin M, Sevik H, Gemici BT, Varol T (2019) Base alteration of some heavy metal concentrations on local and seasonal in Bartın River. *Environ Monit Assess* 191:594. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-7753-0>
 24. Çiçek N, Yücedağ C (2021) Ateş çiçeğinde (*Salvia splendens*) yetiştirme ortamı olarak fındık zırfunun kullanımı. *Artvin Çoruh Üniv Orman Fakült Derg* 22(2):202–208
 25. Yücedağ C, Müller M, Gailing O (2021) Morphological and genetic variation in natural populations of *Quercus vulcanica* and *Q. frainetto*. *Plant Syst Evol* 307(1):1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00606-020-01737-w>
 26. Yucedag C, Ozel HB, Cetin M, Sevik H (2019) Variability in morphological traits of seedlings from five *Euonymus japonicus* cultivars. *Environ Monit Assess* 191(5):1–4. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-7464-6>
 27. Yücedağ C, Kaya LG (2019) Impacts of air pollutants to plants. *J Grad School Nat Appl Sci Mehmet Akif Ersoy Univ* 7(1):67–74 <http://hdl.handle.net/11672/1575>
 28. Bozdoğan Sert E, Turkmen M, Cetin M (2019) Heavy metal accumulation in rosemary leaves and stems exposed to traffic-related pollution near Adana-İskenderun Highway (Hatay, Turkey). *Environ Monit Assess* 191(9):553. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-7714-7>
 29. Zeren Cetin I, Ozel HB (2020) Varol T (2020) Integrating of settlement area in urban and forest area of Bartın with climatic condition decision for managements. *Air Qual Atmos Health* 13(8):1013–1022. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-020-00871-1>
 30. Zeren I, Cantürk U, Yaşar MO (2017) Change of chlorophyll quantity in some landscaping plants. (Bazı peyzaj bitkilerinde klorofil miktarının değişimi). *Bartın Orman Fakült Derg* 19(2):174–182.
 31. Zeren I, Cesur A, Saleh EAA, Mossi MMM (2017) Variation of chlorophyll amount in some landscape plants: A case study of Rize. *Journal of Chemical, Biological and Physical Sciences* 7(3):807–817
 32. Cetin M, Sevik H (2020) Cobanoglu O (2020) Ca, Cu, and Li in washed and unwashed specimens of needles, bark, and branches of the blue spruce (*Picea pungens*) in the city of Ankara. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 27:21816–21825. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-08687-3>
 33. Sevik H, Cetin M, Ozel HB, Erbek A, Zeren Cetin I (2021) The effect of climate on leaf micromorphological characteristics in some broad-leaved species. *Environ Dev Sustain* 23(4):6395–6407. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10668-020-00877-w>
 34. Bozdoğan Sert E, Kaya E, Adiguzel F, Cetin M, Gungor S, Zeren Cetin I, Dinc Y (2021) Effect of the surface temperature of surface materials on thermal comfort: a case study of Iskenderun (Hatay, Turkey). *Theor Appl Climatol* 144(1):103–113. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00704-021-03524-0>
 35. Sevik H, Cetin M, Ozel HB, Akarsu H, Zeren Cetin I (2020) Analyzing of usability of tree-rings as biomonitors for monitoring heavy metal accumulation in the atmosphere in urban area: a case study of cedar tree (*Cedrus* sp.). *Environ Monit Assess* 192, 23. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-8010-2>
 36. Zeren Cetin I, Sevik H (2020) Investigation of the relationship between bioclimatic comfort and land use by using GIS and RS techniques in Trabzon. *Environ Monit Assess* 192(2):71. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-8029-4>
 37. Zeren I, Cesur A, Keskin R, Akarsu H (2018) Bazı peyzaj bitkilerinde klorofil miktarının değişimi: Samsun örneği. *Kastamonu University Journal of Engineering and Sciences* 4(1):1–10
 38. Akarsu H, Zeren Cetin I, Jawed AA, Aisha AESA, Cesur A, Keskin R (2019) *Fraxinus excelsior* L.'da bazı ağır metal konsantrasyonlarının organel ve trafik yoğunluğuna bağlı değişimi. *Uluslararası Mühendislik Tasarım ve Teknoloji Der-gisi* 1(1): 24–30.
 39. Adiguzel F, Bozdoğan Sert E, Dinc Y, Cetin M, Gungor S, Yuka P (2021) ... & Vural E (2021) Determining the relationships between climatic elements and thermal comfort and tourism activities using the tourism climate index for urban planning: a case study of Izmir Province. *Theor Appl Climatol*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00704-021-03874-9>
 40. Savas DS, Sevik H, Isinkaralar K, Turkyilmaz A (2021) Cetin M (2021) The potential of using *Cedrus atlantica* as a biomonitor in the concentrations of Cr and Mn. *Environ Sci Pollut Res*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-14826-1>
 41. Karacocuk T, Sevik H, Isinkaralar K, Turkyilmaz A (2021) Cetin M (2021) The change of Cr and Mn concentrations in selected plants in Samsun city center depending on traffic density. *Landscape Ecol Eng*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11355-021-00483-6>
 42. Sevik H, Cetin M, Ozel HB, Ozel S (2020) Zeren Cetin I (2020a) Changes in heavy metal accumulation in some edible landscape plants depending on traffic density. *Environ Monit Assess* 192:78. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-8041-8>
 43. Aktaş S (2019) Determination of some elements in silver industry ore and waste by ICP-OES. *Kütahya Dumlupınar University Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences Department of Chemistry Master's Thesis*. 82 p.
 44. Sevik H, Cetin M, Ozturk A, Ozel HB, Pinar B (2019) Changes in Pb, Cr and Cu concentrations in some bioindicators depending on traffic density on the basis of species and organs. *Appl Ecol Environ Res* 17(6):12843–12857
 45. Sevik H, Ozel HB, Cetin M, Özel HU (2019) Erdem T (2019b) Determination of changes in heavy metal accumulation depending on plant species, plant organism, and traffic density in some landscape plants. *Air Qual Atmos Health* 12:189–195. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11869-018-0641-x>
 46. Turkyilmaz A, Sevik H, Isinkaralar K, Cetin M (2019) Use of tree rings as a bioindicator to observe atmospheric heavy metal deposition. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 26:5122–5130. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-018-3962-2>
 47. Hrivnak M, Paule L, Krajmerová D, Kulaç Ş, Şevik H, Turna İ, Tvauri I, Gömöry D (2017) Genetic variation in Tertiary relics: the case of eastern-Mediterranean *Abies* (Pinaceae). *Ecol Evol* 7(23):10018–10030. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ece3.3519>
 48. Güney D, Yahyaoglu Z, Bayraktar A, Atar F, Turna I (2019) Genetic diversity of *Picea orientalis* (L.) Link populations in Turkey. *Šumarski list* 143(11–12): 539–547.
 49. Imren E, Kurt R, Yucedag C, Bilir N, Ozel HB, Cetin M, Sevik H (2021) Selection of superior clones by the multi-dimensional decision making techniques in Scots pine seed orchard. *Journal of Forests* 8(1):13–22

50. Canturk U, Kulac S (2021) The effects of climate change scenarios on *Tilia* spp. in Turkey. *Environ Monit Assess* **193**: 771 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-021-09546-5>
51. Varol T, Ozel HB, Ertugrul M, Emir T, Tunay M, Cetin M (2021) Sevik H (2021a) Prediction of soil-bearing capacity on forest roads by statistical approaches. *Environ Monit Assess* **193**:527. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-021-09335-0>
52. Varol T, Canturk U, Cetin M, Ozel HB, Sevik H. (2021b) Impacts of climate change scenarios on European ash tree (*Fraxinus excelsior* L.) in Turkey. *Forest Ecology and Management* **491** (2021) 119199. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2021.119199>
53. Ertugrul M, Varol T, Ozel HB, Cetin M (2021) Sevik H (2021) Influence of climatic factor of changes in forest fire danger and fire season length in Turkey. *Environ Monit Assess* **193**:28. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-020-08800-6>
54. Kulaç Ş, Nzokou P, Güney D, Cregg BM, Turna I (2012) Growth and physiological response of Fraser fir [*Abies fraseri* (Pursh) Poir.] seedlings to water stress: seasonal and diurnal variations in photosynthetic pigments and carbohydrate concentration. *HortScience* **47**(10): 1512–1519.
55. Yildiz D, Nzokou P, Deligoz A, Koc I, Genc M (2014) Chemical and physiological responses of four Turkish red pine (*Pinus brutia* Ten.) provenances to cold temperature treatments. *Eur J Forest Res* **133**, 809–818 (2014). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10342-014-0798-2>
56. Ozel HB, Cetin M, Sevik H, Varol T, Isik B, Yaman B (2021) (2021a) The effects of base station as an electromagnetic radiation source on flower and cone yield and germination percentage in *Pinus brutia* Ten. *Biologia Futura*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42977-021-00085-1>
57. Ozel HB, Abo Aisha AES, Cetin M, Sevik H, Zeren Cetin I (2021) The effects of increased exposure time to UV-B radiation on germination and seedling development of Anatolian black pine seeds. *Environ Monit Assess* **193**:388. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-021-09178-9>
58. Koc İ (2021) Changes that may occur in temperature, rain, and climate types due to global climate change: the example of Düzce. *Turkish Journal of Agriculture-Food Science and Technology* **9**(8):1545–1554
59. Koc İ (2021) Examining seed germination rate and seedlings gas exchange performances of some Turkish red pine provenances under water stress. *Düzce University Journal of Science & Technology* **9**(3):48–60
60. Güney D, Atar F, Atar E, Turna İ, Kulaç Ş (2015) The effect of pre-treatments and seed collection time on the germination characteristics of common hornbeam (*Carpinus betulus*) seeds in the Eastern Black Sea Region. *Turkey Seed Science and Technology* **43**(1):1–9
61. Koc I (2019) Conifers response to water stress: physiological responses and effects on nutrient use physiology. Ph.D. Dissertation, Michigan State University, USA.
62. Kulaç Ş, Nayır HN (2021) Determination of grafting adaptation of some chestnut (*Castanea sativa* Mill.) genotypes with Marigoule (*C. Sativax C. Crenata*) cultivar. *Turkish Journal of Agriculture-Food Science and Technology* **9**(8): 1555–1559.
63. Turna İ, Kulaç Ş, Güney D, Seyis E (2013) Effects of media and hormones on highbush blueberry (*Vaccinium corymbosum* L.) production from cuttings. *Düzce Üniversitesi Orman Fakültesi Ormanlık Dergisi* **9**(2): 93–104.
64. Yıldırım N, Bayraktar A, Atar F, Güney D, Öztürk M, Turna I (2020) Effects of different genders and hormones on stem cuttings of *Salix anatolica*. *J Sustain For* **39**(3):300–308. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10549811.2019.1638274>
65. Güney D, Bayraktar A, Atar F, Turna İ (2020) Effects of root undercutting, fertilization and thinning on seedling growth and quality of oriental beech (*Fagus orientalis* Lipsky) seedlings. *Artvin Çoruh Üniversitesi Orman Fakültesi Dergisi* **21**(2):214–222
66. Wilson AR, Nzokou P, Güney D, Kulaç Ş (2013) Growth response and nitrogen use physiology of Fraser fir (*Abies fraseri*), red pine (*Pinus resinosa*), and hybrid poplar under amino acid nutrition. *New For* **44**(2):281–295
67. Kulaç Ş, Yıldız Ö (2016) Effect of fertilization on the morphological development of European Hophornbeam (*Ostrya carpinifolia* Scop.) Seedlings. *Turkish Journal of Agriculture-Food Science and Technology* **4**(10): 813–821.
68. Shults P, Nzokou P, Koc I (2020) Nitrogen contributions of alley cropped *Trifolium pratense* may sustain short rotation woody crop yields on marginal lands. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosyst* **117**(2):261–272
69. Turkyilmaz A, Sevik H, Isinkaralar K (2018) Cetin M (2018a) Using *Acer platanoides* annual rings to monitor the amount of heavy metals accumulated in air. *Environ Monit Assess* **190**:578. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-018-6956-0>
70. Turkyilmaz A, Sevik H, Cetin M (2018) The use of perennial needles as bio-monitors for recently accumulated heavy metals. *Landscape Ecol Eng* **14**:115–120. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11355-017-0335-9>
71. Cetin M, Sevik H, Yigit N, Ozel HB, Aricak B, Varol T (2018) The variable of leaf micromorphological characters on grown in distinct climate conditions in some landscape plants. *Fresen Environ Bull* **27**(5):3206–3211
72. Cetin M, Sevik H (2018) Yigit N (2018b) Climate type-related changes in the leaf micromorphological characters of certain landscape plants. *Environ Monit Assess* **190**(7):404. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-018-6783-3>
73. Yigit N, Mutevelli Z, Sevik H, Onat SM, Ozel HB, Cetin M, Olgun C (2021) Identification of some fiber characteristics in *Rosa* sp. and *Nerium oleander* L. wood grown under different ecological conditions. *BioResources* **16**(3): 5862–5874. DOI:<https://doi.org/10.15376/biores.14.3.7015-7024>
74. Sevik H, Cetin M, Ozel HU, Ozel HB, Mossi MMM (2020) Zren Cetin I (2020b) Determination of Pb and Mg accumulation in some of the landscape plants in shrub forms. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* **27**:2423–2431. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-019-06895-0>
75. Aricak B, Cetin M, Erdem R, Sevik H, Cometen H (2020) The usability of Scotch pine (*Pinus sylvestris*) as a biomonitor for traffic-originated heavy metal concentrations in Turkey. *Pol J Environ Stud* **29**(2):1051–1057. <https://doi.org/10.15244/pjoes/109244>
76. Yigit N, Cetin M, Ozturk A, Sevik H, Cetin S (2019) Variation of stomatal characteristics in broad leaved species based on habitat. *Appl Ecol Environ Res* **17** (6):12859–12868. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/https://doi.org/10.15666/aer/1706_1285912868
77. Koç İ (2021) Using *Cedrus atlantica*'s annual rings as a biomonitor in observing the changes of Ni and Co concentrations in the atmosphere. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* **28**:35880–35886. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-13272-3>
78. Aricak B, Cetin M, Erdem R, Sevik H, Cometen H (2019) The change of some heavy metal concentrations in Scotch pine (*Pinus sylvestris*) depending on traffic density, organelle and washing. *Appl Ecol Environ Res* **17**(3): 6723–6734. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/https://doi.org/10.15666/aer/1703_67236734
79. Ucu Ozel H, Gemici BT, Gemici E, Ozel HB, Cetin M (2020) Sevik H (2020) Application of artificial neural networks to predict the heavy metal contamination in the Bartın River. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* **27**:42495–42512. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-10156-w>
80. Alaçouri HAA, Genc CO, Aricak B, Kuzmina N, Menshikov S, Cetin M (2020) The possibility of using Scots pine needles as biomonitor in determination of heavy metal accumulation. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* **27**:20273–20280. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-08449-1>

81. Alaqouri HAA, Ozer Genc C, Aricak B, Kuzmina N, Menshikov S, Cetin M (2020b) The possibility of using Scots pine (*Pinus sylvestris* L.) needles as biomonitor in the determination of heavy metal accumulation. *Appl Ecol Environ Res* 18 (2):3713–3727. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/https://doi.org/10.15666/aecr/1802_37133727
82. Sevik H (2021) The variation of chrome consantration in some landscape plants due to species, organ and traffic density. *Turkish Journal of Agriculture-Food Science and Technology* 9(3):595–600
83. Cesur A, Zeren Cetin I, Abo Aisha AES, Alrabiti OBM, Aljama AMO, Jawed AA, Cetin M, Sevik H (2021) Ozel HB (2021) The usability of *Cupressus arizonica* annual rings in monitoring the changes in heavy metal concentration in air. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 28:35642–35648. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-13166-4>
84. Turkyilmaz A, Cetin M, Sevik H, Isinkaralar K, Saleh EAA (2020) Variation of heavy metal accumulation in certain landscaping plants due to traffic density. *Environ Dev Sustain* 22:2385–2398. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10668-018-0296-7>
85. Kilicoglu C, Cetin M, Aricak B, Sevik H (2021) Integrating multicriteria decision-making analysis for a GIS-based settlement area in the district of Atakum, Samsun, Turkey. *Theor Appl Climatol* 143:379–388. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00704-020-03439-2>
86. Bayraktar OY, Saglam-Citoglu G, Belgin CM, Cetin M (2019) Investigation of the mechanical properties of marble dust and silica fume substituted portland cement samples under high temperature effect. *Fresen Environ Bull* 28(5):3865–3875
87. Bayraktar OY, Saglam-Citoglu G, Belgin CM, Cetin S, Cetin M (2019) Investigation of effect of brick dust and silica fume on the properties of portland cement mortar. *Fresen Environ Bull* 28(11):7823–7832
88. Kravkaz Kuscu IS, Cetin M, Yigit N, Savaci G, Sevik H (2018) Relationship between enzyme activity (urease-catalase) and nutrient element in soil use. *Pol J Environ Stud* 27(5):2107–2112. <https://doi.org/10.15244/pjoes/78475>
89. Kravkaz-Kuscu IS, Sariyildiz T, Cetin M, Yigit N, Sevik H, Savaci G (2018) Evaluation of the soil properties and primary forest tree species in Taskopru (Kastamonu) district. *Fresen Environ Bull* 27(3):1613–1617
90. KalayciOnac A, Cetin M, Sevik H, Orman P, Karci A, GonulluSutcuoglu G (2021) Rethinking the campus transportation network in the scope of ecological design principles: case study of Izmir Katip Çelebi University Çiğli Campus. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 28:50847–50866. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-14299-2>
91. Cetin M, Jawed AA (2021) The chancing of Mg concentrations in some plants grown in Pakistan depends on plant species and the growing environment. *KUJES* 7(2):167–174
92. Cetin M, Sevik H, Aricak B, Ozturk A, Genc CO, Aisha AESA, Jawed AA, Aljama AMO, Alrabiti OBM (2019) The investigation of the changing in concentration of some heavy metals in seeds, leaves, and branches because of traffic density: a case study of *Acer Platanoides*. *Kastamonu Univ J Eng Sci* 5(2):83–92

Publisher's note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.